

Minutes of the Meeting of the Executive Committee Chicago, IL April 29, 2016

The first meeting of the 2016 Executive Committee was called to order at 10:00 AM on April 29, 2016 in the John Wayne Room of the Hyatt Regency O'Hare Hotel, Chicago, IL. Members present were: Daron Acemoglu, David Autor, Marianne Bertrand, John Campbell, Dora Costa, Pinelopi Goldberg, Hilary Hoynes, Guido Imbens, Rachel Kranton, William Nordhaus, Alvin Roth, Peter Rousseau, Robert Shiller, and Richard Thaler. Alan Auerbach (chair) and Nancy Stokey participated in part of the meeting and Susan Athey, Lawrence Katz, Ariel Pakes, and Michael Woodford participated by phone as members of the Honors and Awards Committee. Claudia Goldin (chair), Erica Groshen, Erik Hurst, and Cecilia Rouse (by phone) participated in part of the meeting as members of the Nominating Committee. Anil Kashyap participated in part of the meeting on behalf of the Ad Hoc Committee on AEA Journals. Administrative Director Regina Montgomery also attended.

Shiller thanked past President Richard Thaler for his service, and presented Thaler with a certificate as Distinguished Fellow of the Association. He welcomed the newly elected members of the 2016 Executive Committee: Alvin Roth, President-elect; Daron Acemoglu and Marianne Bertrand, Vice-presidents; and John Campbell and Hilary Hoynes. The minutes of the January 2, 2016 meeting of the Executive Committee were then approved.

Report of the Committee on Honors and Awards (Auerbach).—Auerbach explained that nominations for the Clark Medal were solicited from economics department heads of major research universities. The Honors and Awards Committee (Auerbach (chair), Acemoglu, Athey, Katz, Pakes, Stokey, and Woodford) also examined lists of eligible scholars to ensure that no viable candidate was overlooked. After an extensive discussion of the importance and likely lasting effects of the research contributions of

candidates, the Honors and Awards Committee and Executive Committee members, acting together as an Electoral College, VOTED to award the 2016 John Bates Clark Medal to Yuliy Sannikov.

Report of the Nominating Committee (Goldin).—Goldin, who chaired the Committee (consisting also of Susan Dynarski, Xavier Gabaix, Groshen, Hurst, Dean Karlan, Jonathan Levin, and Rouse), reported nominations for the indicated offices in 2017: Vice-President—Alan Krueger, Olivia Mitchell, Valerie Ramey, and Jonathan Skinner; Executive Committee—Nicholas Bloom, Kerwin Charles, Erica Field, and Judith Hellerstein. The Nominating Committee and the Executive Committee, acting together as an Electoral College, then VOTED to nominate Olivier Blanchard as President-elect, and VOTED to recognize Richard Freeman, Glenn Loury, Julio Rotemberg, and Isabel Sawhill as Distinguished Fellows of the Association.

Report of the Ad Hoc Search Committee for a new Editor of the American Economic Review (Autor).—Thaler appointed a search committee in August 2015 to recommend a replacement for Goldberg, who would be stepping down as Editor of the *AER* in December 2016 after six years of distinguished service. Autor, chair of the search committee (consisting also of Marianne Bertrand, Guido Imbens, Pete Klenow, and Tano Santos), described the process the committee members used to identify and screen prospects to succeed Goldberg. After discussion, it was VOTED to appoint Esther Duflo to a three-year term as Editor effective January 1, 2017.

Interim Report of the Ad Hoc Committee on AEA Journals (Kashyap).—Kashyap reported that the Ad Hoc Committee had mixed views on starting a new journal patterned after those in other disciplines that would include more

compact presentations of results, but that the Committee's inclination was to proceed. The Committee also recommended changing the name of the *American Economic Review: Papers and Proceedings* to the *American Economic Association: Papers and Proceedings* to make clear that the papers were not refereed. A discussion followed where questions were raised about the supply of high-quality shorter papers for the proposed journal, whether contributions would contain provocative expositions of interesting results that might lead to more rejoinders, and whether the journal would strain existing editorial and refereeing resources in the profession. Other comments offered support for expanding the number of the Association's publication outlets, and reasoned that, if the *AEJs* were any indication, there should be sufficient supply of fine papers and that such a journal could be quite different from similar offerings in other disciplines. It was then VOTED that the Committee bring a final proposal to the Executive Committee in January 2017 that would address items raised in the discussion and in particular offer examples of what an issue of the new journal might look like.

Report of the Sub-Committee on Non-Discrimination in the Economics Profession (Costa).—Costa reported that, at the Sub-Committee's recommendation, the Association had sponsored a successful breakfast for LGBT economists at the 2016 ASSA meetings attended by about 60 economists, and reviewed the useful and thoughtful report prepared by organizers Lee Badgett and Kitt Carpenter summarizing the breakfast and related recommendations. After discussion, it was VOTED that the Association commit to continuing the breakfast for the next three years (2017–2019) so that the organizers can plan accordingly, and that the organizers continue to report on each breakfast (attendance, feedback, proposals). It was also VOTED to encourage Badgett and Carpenter, in accordance with their recommendation, to propose a budget for a newsletter for the group in the hopes that an AEA-supported network would build and flourish. Costa reported that the Sub-Committee continues to discuss the possibility of a survey of the Association's members on issues related to the climate on nondiscrimination in the profession.

Update on Atlanta 2018 (Rousseau).—Rousseau provided an update on the concern

regarding the 2018 Annual Meeting scheduled for Atlanta on January 5–7 (Friday, Saturday, Sunday) in which the city, though it has a contract with the Association, bid for and won the NCAA Football Championship on Monday January 8, 2018. He reported that the Association had rejected Atlanta's request to either begin the meeting two days earlier or negotiate a swap with Philadelphia, which was already scheduled for 2019, and that he, with the assistance of the General Counsel, had proposed a mediation process through which the Association might recover damages along with a release to move the 2018 meeting to another city altogether. The Atlanta Convention Bureau then convened a meeting of the Atlanta hotels, where it was decided that the city would meet its contractual obligations and keep the meeting on January 5–7. Rousseau noted that the Association has 6,700 rooms booked on the peak night in Atlanta, but that it might be difficult to secure the additional 800 downtown or midtown rooms that would be needed at the \$105 conference rate. Given the disruptions that the game itself and possible lack of sufficient rooms might cause for meeting participants, even though Atlanta had committed to meeting its 2018 obligations, Rousseau requested authorization to negotiate a switch with Philadelphia if still possible. After some discussion, authorization was granted.

Report of the Audit Committee (Costa).—The Audit Committee (Costa (chair), Kranton, and Campbell) met with the Association's auditors, Frasier, Dean, and Howard, by teleconference on March 29, 2016. The Committee concluded there are no material difficulties with the Association's accounting procedures or financial controls. The auditors reported a clean audit to the Committee. Acting on the recommendation of the Committee, it was VOTED to accept the audit for 2015.

Report of the Advisory Committee on Editorial Appointments (Imbens).—Imbens (chair) presented the set of editorial appointments that the Advisory Committee was forwarding to the Executive Committee for action. Acting on Goldberg's recommendation, it was then VOTED to appoint Heski Bar-Isaac to an initial three-year term on the Board of Editors of the *American Economic Review* ending in March 2019. Acting

on Esther Duflo's recommendation, it was VOTED to appoint David Donaldson to an initial three-year term as coeditor of *AEJ: Applied Economics* ending in April 2019, Ben Olken to an initial three-year term as coeditor starting in January 2017 and ending in December 2019, and Nava Ashraf, Rema Hanna, Patrick Kline, Victor Lavy, Karthik Muralidharan, Tavneet Suri, and Diane Whitmore Schanzenbach to initial three-year terms on the Board of Editors ending in June 2019, and to reappoint Pascaline Dupas to a second three-year term on the Board of Editors starting in January 2017 and ending in December 2019, and Alessandro Gavazza, Peter Kuhn, Ethan Lewis, Atif Mian, Chad Syverson, and Miguel Urquiola to second three-year terms on the Board ending in June 2019. Acting on Matthew Shapiro's recommendation, it was VOTED to appoint Matthew Notowidigdo to an initial three-year term as coeditor of *AEJ: Economic Policy* ending in June 2019, and Susan Dynarski, Meredith Fowlie, Ryan Kellog, Mireille Jacobson, Joshua Rauh, Robert Town, and Jonathan Zinman to initial three-year terms on the Board of Editors ending in April 2019, and to reappoint Lucas Davis, Deborah Lucas, and Kathleen McGarry to second three-year terms on the Board ending in May 2019, Douglas Almond, Dhammika Dharmapala, and Henrik Kleven to third three-year terms on the Board ending in April 2019, and Erzo Luttmer to a third three-year term on the Board ending in May 2019. Acting on Andrew Postlewaite's recommendation, it was VOTED to appoint Michael Ostrovsky to an initial three-year term as coeditor of *AEJ: Microeconomics*, and Eric Budish, Jakub Kastl, Aviv Nevo, and Laura Veldkamp to initial three-year terms on the Board of Editors, and to reappoint Wouter Dessein and Katja Seim to second three-year terms and Darrell Duffie, Kenneth Hendricks, Leslie Marx, Paul Milgrom, Wojciech Olszewski, Ariel Pakes, Tom Palfrey, Phil Reny, Bernard Salanie, and Asher Wolinsky to fourth three-year terms on the Board, with all terms ending in June 2019.

Imbens then raised the question of whether the current constraint at the *AEJs* of no more than four Editorial Board appointments from a single institution should be relaxed given the extent to which the *AEJs* have grown. He noted that the rules for the *AER* allow up to six appointments from a single institution, with no more than four from an individual unit within

an institution. After discussion on the desirability of broad institutional representation on the Association's editorial boards, it was decided to retain the current rules. Discussion then turned to term limits for members of the Association's editorial boards at the *AEA* journals, which are currently unlimited. After discussion, it was VOTED to limit terms on the *AER* and *AEJs* to three, three-year terms effective with the next renewal cycle.

AEJ Best Paper Prizes for 2016 (Rousseau).—On behalf of the respective editorial boards, Rousseau announced the winners of the sixth annual *AEJ* Best Paper Award: Giovanni Mastrobuoni and Paolo Pinotti for "Legal Status and the Criminal Activity of Immigrants" (*AEJ: Applied Economics*, April 2015); Martin Gaynor, Rodrigo Moreno-Serra, and Carol Propper for "Death by Market Power: Reform, Competition, and Patient Outcomes in the National Health Service" (*AEJ: Economic Policy*, November 2013); Mark Gertler and Peter Karadi for "Monetary Policy Surprises, Credit Costs, and Economic Activity" (*AEJ: Macroeconomics*, January 2015); and Igal Hendel, Alessandro Lizzeri, and Nikita Roketskiy for "Nonlinear Pricing of Storable Goods" (*AEJ: Microeconomics*, August 2014).

Committee on the Status of Women in the Economics Profession (Rousseau).—Rousseau reviewed a one-time request by CSWEP for \$62,195 in additional funding to be used in the remainder of 2016 and in 2017. It included requests for: (i) \$40,941 to preserve and make research-ready 43 years of data from the CSWEP Annual Survey on the gender composition of US economics departments; (ii) \$6,900 to enhance digital information dissemination through the CSWEP newsletter and integration with the Association's new website; and (iii) \$14,354 for additional staff support at the CSWEP office at Duke University to facilitate the migration to UC-Santa Barbara. It was then VOTED to approve the request.

Report on 2017 Annual Meeting (Roth).—Roth announced that submissions for the Association's 2017 meeting had closed on April 15 and were being organized for evaluation by the Program Committee. In addition to choosing Esther Duflo to deliver the Ely Lecture and

Eric Budish as speaker for the AEA/AFA joint luncheon, he noted that several videotaped panels were in preparation, including one organized by Claudia Goldin and Muriel Niederle on the “Gender Agenda” and another organized by Roth and Paul Milgrom on the topic of “Economists as Engineers.”

Survey of JOE Network Users and Planned System Enhancements (Rousseau).—Rousseau summarized responses to a survey conducted in early 2016 among users of the *JOE Network*. He remarked that the system continued to perform well in its second year and that the feedback obtained will be taken into account in planning improvements for the 2016 job cycle. Most found the system easy to use, but many institutions continue to require their economics departments to use university-wide systems to process reference letters while others continue to receive them by e-mail or regular mail. He indicated that raising awareness of *JOE*’s letter delivery services could help bring some of these institutions into the system. Rousseau described enhancements planned for 2016, including an interview scheduling feature, embedding of video material into candidate profiles, increased use of Twitter for announcing new jobs, interoperability with Interfolio, and integration with the new web design to allow for more streamlined access on mobile devices.

ASSA Session Allocations (Rousseau).—Rousseau presented attendance data gathered over the previous four years for sessions held by member societies at the ASSA meeting. He noted that session allocations were determined by an advisory committee to the AEA Executive Committee consisting of the six founding societies of ASSA (Agricultural and Applied Economics Association, American Economic Association, American Finance Association, Econometric Society, Association for Social Economics, and Labor and Industrial Relations Association) and three rotating members on the final day of the ASSA meetings each year, but that there were several societies with sustained low attendance which he might ask to reduce the number of sessions voluntarily. After noting that existing procedures of the advisory committee made reducing sessions a lengthy process, the Executive Committee recommended that Rousseau work with the advisory committee to

form a consistent rule for session reduction that would allow for more rapid action, but that the elimination of a society’s single session should be done only after more thorough evaluation.

Annual Business Meeting (Rousseau).—Rousseau reported that, in response to a request, he had consulted with the General Counsel about the necessity of the Association’s Annual Business Meeting held during ASSA each January and had learned that the Association, being incorporated in the District of Columbia, is required to have an Annual Meeting. The statute, however, does not define the content of such a mandatory meeting. That said, the General Counsel recommended that the Annual Meeting continue to make substantive content available to attendees along with the opportunity for comment. After some discussion of the merits of holding an Annual Business Meeting, the Counsel’s recommendation was accepted.

Report of the Secretary (Rousseau).—Rousseau reviewed the schedule for sites and dates of future meetings: Chicago, January 6–8, 2017 (Friday, Saturday, Sunday); Atlanta, January 5–7, 2018 (Friday, Saturday, Sunday); Philadelphia, January 4–6, 2019 (Friday, Saturday, Sunday); San Diego, January 3–5, 2020 (Friday, Saturday, Sunday); Chicago, January 3–5, 2021 (Sunday, Monday, Tuesday); Boston, January 7–9, 2022 (Friday, Saturday, Sunday); New Orleans, January 6–8, 2023 (Friday, Saturday, Sunday); and San Antonio, January 5–7, 2024 (Friday, Saturday, Sunday).

The 2016 meeting in San Francisco drew 13,335 registrants, surpassing Boston’s previous record of 12,859 registrants in 2015. The 2014 meeting (Philadelphia) drew 12,218 in 2014. The 2013 meeting (San Diego) drew 11,371 registrants. The previous San Francisco meeting in 2009 drew 10,829. Fifty-six other societies met with the Association in 2016, 520 scholarly sessions were organized, and 257 events (lunches, receptions, committee meetings, breakfasts, workshops, etc.) were scheduled.

The Association’s eighth Continuing Education Program was held immediately after the 2016 annual meetings. The goal is to help mid-career economists maintain their research skills. Each of the three simultaneous programs included 12 hours of lectures by a team of 2 economists. Topics for 2016 were economics of

crime (John J. Donohue and Jens Ludwig), field experiments (Dean Karlan and John A. List), and microeconomics of life course inequality (Steven Durlauf and James J. Heckman). There were 177 participants in total, down from 232 in 2015. The lectures were recorded and are publicly available on the AEA website.

The Association launched a newly redesigned website in April to streamline navigation to its priority content (journals, annual meeting, and JOE) and to bring current AEA research to the forefront for a wider audience. The “look and feel” and content strategy were developed in collaboration with the web design firm Bearded.com. The website features responsive web design (for optimal viewing across all desktop browsers and mobile devices), a unified login system (no longer requiring separate accounts for members and nonmembers), and has been deployed on a custom Content Management System (CMS) built by AEA developers on an industry leading programming framework (Yii2). The new platform allows for continued integration of web initiatives and applications moving forward.

The Association’s Conflict of Interest Policy requires that the Minutes of the Executive Committee record the names of persons who have an actual or potential financial or positional conflict of interest, the nature of the interest, actions taken to decide whether a conflict exists, and the final decision as to whether there is an actual conflict of interest. The Association’s Budget and Finance Committee reviews potential conflicts of interest to determine whether an actual conflict exists. In 2016, Acemoglu identified a potential conflict of interest as a member of the Association’s Committee on Honors and Awards, and as an occasional paid public speaker. Mark Aguiar identified a potential conflict of interest as a member of the Advisory Board for the Carnegie-Rochester-NYU Conference on Public Policy, and as a visiting scholar at the Federal Reserve Banks of New York and Philadelphia. John Asker identified a potential conflict of interest as a consultant to the Federal Communications Commission. Autor identified a potential conflict of interest as a member of the Executive Committee of the Society of Labor Economics, as a paid Associate of the NBER’s Disabilities Research Center, and as a consultant to the Social Security Administration. Bertrand identified a potential conflict of interest as a result of being both a

member of the AEA Executive Committee and a Coeditor of the *American Economic Review*. Legal counsel Terry Calvani noted a potential conflict of interest in that he regularly provides legal services on a pro bono basis through his firm, Freshfields Bruckhaus Deringer, but that it is possible that the Association might retain the firm to represent it under some circumstances. Campbell identified a potential conflict of interest as an Associate Editor of the *Journal of Financial Economics*, an advisory board member of the *Journal of Financial Econometrics* and the *Journal of Money, Credit and Banking*, as a member of the US Treasury’s Research Advisory Committee, and as an advisor to the Academic Research Council and the Consumer Financial Protection Bureau. Costa identified a potential conflict of interest as Director of the NBER Cohort Studies Working Group. Steven Durlauf reported a potential conflict of interest from being under contract to write a book for Oxford University Press. John Friedman reported a potential conflict of interest as an unpaid Federal contractor with the Internal Revenue Service. Matthew Gentzkow identified a potential conflict of interest as Associate Editor of the *RAND Journal of Economics*, as a member of the Toulouse Network for Information Technology, and as a research associate of the NBER. Hoynes identified a potential conflict of interest as a result of being both a member of the AEA Executive Committee and a Coeditor of the *American Economic Review*. Alexandre Mas identified a potential conflict of interest as a member of the International Editorial Board of the *Industrial and Labor Relations Review*, and the *British Journal of Industrial Relations*. Debraj Ray identified a potential conflict of interest as a member of the editorial board of the *Journal of Economic Growth*. Richard Rogerson identified a potential conflict of interest as Associate Editor of the *Review of Economic Dynamics*. Rousseau reported a potential conflict of interest as a member of the advisory board of *Explorations in Economic History* and the editorial board of the *Journal of Economic Education*, and as an Associate Editor for the *Journal of Productivity Analysis*, and for *E-conomics*, and as Chair, ex officio, of the AEA Budget and Finance Committee. Roth reported a potential conflict of interest as a member of the Council of the Econometric Society. Matthew Shapiro reported a potential

conflict of interest as Editor of *American Economic Journal: Economic Policy*, a research associate of the NBER, and principal investigator of grants to the University of Michigan from the National Institutes of Health, the National Science Foundation, and the Sloan Foundation. Shiller reported a potential conflict of interest involving Princeton University Press book contracts, a consulting arrangement with Barclays Bank PLC, a member of the Competitive Markets Advisory Council of CME Group, a speaker's contract with the Leigh Bureau, as a *New York Times* columnist and contributor to Project Syndicate newspaper columns, and through Standard and Poor's publication of the Case-Shiller Index. Dan Silverman identified a potential conflict of interest as a research advisor to Capital Preferences, LTD. After reviewing the potential conflicts and mechanisms to avoid actual conflicts (e.g., Rousseau does not participate in Budget and Finance Committee decisions on economists' raises), the Budget and Finance Committee concluded that there were no actual conflicts.

Report of the Treasurer (Rousseau).—Rousseau reported that the audited financial statements for 2015 show an operating surplus of \$281,000, down from \$378,000 in 2014. Including investment income and losses, there was an overall 2015 deficit of \$26,000. He presented a revised budget for 2016 based on information received between November 2015 and April 2016, predicting an operating loss of \$378,000; a surplus of \$354,000 had been predicted in January.

The combined 2015 operating deficit and portfolio losses lowered the January 1, 2016 ratio of accumulated net unrestricted assets

to 2016 expected expenditures to 3.1 from 3.3 in the previous year. The Association's target ratio is 1.5 to 2.5, established by the Executive Committee in 2009. The Association's net unrestricted assets on December 31, 2015 were \$33.4 million, down \$26,000 from the year prior. Total assets on December 31, 2015 were \$37 million, of which \$34.4 million consisted of cash and financial investments, \$2.2 million were accounts receivable, and \$0.7 million were prepaid expenses, furniture, and equipment. Liabilities were \$3.8 million, of which \$2.1 million consisted of prepaid membership dues and subscriptions, \$1 million was deferred annual meeting revenue, and \$0.7 million was accounts payable. The Association also held \$0.2 million of temporarily restricted assets.

At Rousseau's request and following approval by the Budget and Finance Committee, it was VOTED to authorize Gwyn P. Loftis, the Association's Convention Manager, as cosigner for the AEA and ASSA operating accounts with SunTrust Bank.

New Business.—Shiller proposed that the Executive Committee consider a new lecture named after a woman for the Association's annual meeting. After some discussion, including for whom such a lecture might be named and how it could be arranged within the structure of the annual meeting, Shiller announced that he would appoint an ad hoc committee to investigate this possibility and make recommendations.

There being no further business, it was VOTED to adjourn at 4:30 PM.

Respectfully submitted,
PETER L. ROUSSEAU, *Secretary*