

The Journal of

Economic Perspectives

*A journal of the
American Economic Association*

Winter 2012

The Journal of **Economic Perspectives**

A journal of the American Economic Association

Editor

David H. Autor, Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Co-editors

Chang-Tai Hsieh, University of Chicago

John A. List, University of Chicago

Associate Editors

Katherine Baicker, Harvard University

Benjamin G. Edelman, Harvard University

Robert C. Feenstra, University of California at Davis

Raymond Fisman, Columbia University

Gordon Hanson, University of California at San Diego

Susan Houseman, Upjohn Institute for Employment Research

Anil Kashyap, University of Chicago

Jonathan Morduch, New York University

Rohini Pande, Harvard University

Bruce Sacerdote, Dartmouth College

Kerry Smith, Arizona State University

Chad Syverson, University of Chicago

Managing Editor

Timothy Taylor

Assistant Editor

Ann Norman

Editorial offices:

Journal of Economic Perspectives

American Economic Association Publications

2403 Sidney St., #260

Pittsburgh, PA 15203

e-mail: <jep@jepjournal.org>

The *Journal of Economic Perspectives* gratefully acknowledges the support of Macalester College. Registered in the U.S. Patent and Trademark Office (®).

Copyright © 2012 by the American Economic Association; All Rights Reserved.

Composed by American Economic Association Publications, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, U.S.A.

Printed by R. R. Donnelley Company, Jefferson City, Missouri, 65109, U.S.A.

No responsibility for the views expressed by the authors in this journal is assumed by the editors or by the American Economic Association.

THE JOURNAL OF ECONOMIC PERSPECTIVES (ISSN 0895-3309), Winter 2012, Vol. 26, No. 1. The *JEP* is published quarterly (February, May, August, November) by the American Economic Association, 2014 Broadway, Suite 305, Nashville, TN 37203-2418. Annual dues for regular membership are \$20.00, \$30.00, or \$40.00 depending on income; for an additional \$15.00, you can receive this journal in print. Further information on subscriptions and the American Economic Association can be found at <<http://www.vanderbilt.edu/AEA/>>. Periodicals postage paid at Nashville, TN, and at additional mailing offices.

POSTMASTER: Send address changes to the *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 2014 Broadway, Suite 305, Nashville, TN 37203. Printed in the U.S.A.

The Journal of
Economic Perspectives

Contents

Volume 26 • Number 1 • Winter 2012

Symposia

Energy Challenges

- Hunt Allcott and Michael Greenstone, “Is There an Energy Efficiency Gap?” . . . 3
Paul L. Joskow, “Creating a Smarter U.S. Electricity Grid” 29
Lucas W. Davis, “Prospects for Nuclear Power” 49
Severin Borenstein, “The Private and Public Economics of Renewable Electricity
Generation” 67
Christopher R. Knittel, “Reducing Petroleum Consumption from
Transportation” 93
Catherine Wolfram, Orié Shelef, and Paul Gertler, “How Will Energy Demand
Develop in the Developing World?” 119

Higher Education

- David J. Deming, Claudia Goldin, and Lawrence F. Katz, “The For-Profit
Postsecondary School Sector: Nimble Critters or Agile Predators?” . . 139
Christopher Avery and Sarah Turner, “Student Loans: Do College Students
Borrow Too Much—Or Not Enough?” 165
Ronald G. Ehrenberg, “American Higher Education in Transition” 193

Articles

- Maury Gittleman and Brooks Pierce, “Compensation for State and Local
Government Workers” 217
Timothy Taylor, “Recommendations for Further Reading” 243
Notes 251

Statement of Purpose

The *Journal of Economic Perspectives* attempts to fill a gap between the general interest press and most other academic economics journals. The journal aims to publish articles that will serve several goals: to synthesize and integrate lessons learned from active lines of economic research; to provide economic analysis of public policy issues; to encourage cross-fertilization of ideas among the fields of economics; to offer readers an accessible source for state-of-the-art economic thinking; to suggest directions for future research; to provide insights and readings for classroom use; and to address issues relating to the economics profession. Articles appearing in the journal are normally solicited by the editors and associate editors. Proposals for topics and authors should be directed to the journal office, at the address inside the front cover.

Policy on Data Availability

It is the policy of the *Journal of Economic Perspectives* to publish papers only if the data used in the analysis are clearly and precisely documented and are readily available to any researcher for purposes of replication. Details of the computations sufficient to permit replication must be provided. The Editor should be notified at the time of submission if the data used in a paper are proprietary or if, for some other reason, the above requirements cannot be met.

Policy on Disclosure

Authors of articles appearing in the *Journal of Economic Perspectives* are expected to disclose any potential conflicts of interest that may arise from their consulting activities, financial interests, or other nonacademic activities.

Journal of Economic Perspectives Advisory Board

Abhijit Banerjee, Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Olivier Blanchard, International Monetary Fund

Judy Chevalier, Yale University

Dora Costa, Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Elizabeth Hoffman, Iowa State University

Patrick Kehoe, University of Minnesota

Christopher Jencks, Harvard University

David Leonhardt, *The New York Times*

Carmen Reinhart, Peterson Institute

Eugene Steuerle, Urban Institute

Luigi Zingales, University of Chicago

The American Economic Association

Correspondence relating to advertising, business matters, permission to quote, or change of address should be sent to the AEA business office: <aeainfo@vanderbilt.edu>. Street address: American Economic Association, 2014 Broadway, Suite 305, Nashville, TN 37203. For membership and subscriptions, go to the AEA website: <<http://www.aeaweb.org>>. Annual dues for regular membership are \$20.00, 30.00, or \$40.00, depending on income; for an additional \$15.00, you can receive this journal in print. Change of address notice must be received at least six weeks prior to the publication month.

Copyright © 2012 by the American Economic Association. Permission to make digital or hard copies of part or all of this work for personal or classroom use is granted without fee provided that copies are not made or distributed for profit or direct commercial advantage and that copies show this notice on the first page or initial screen of a display along with the full citation, including the name of the author. Copyrights for components of this work owned by others than AEA must be honored. Abstracting with credit is permitted. The author has the right to republish, post on servers, redistribute to lists, and use any component of this work in other works. For others to do so requires prior specific permission and/or a fee. Permissions may be requested from the American Economic Association, 2014 Broadway, Suite 305, Nashville, TN 37203; e-mail: (aeainfo@vanderbilt.edu).

Founded in 1885

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

Elected Officers and Members

President

CHRISTOPHER A. SIMS, Princeton University

President-elect

CLAUDIA GOLDIN, Harvard University

Vice Presidents

CHRISTINA H. PAXSON, Princeton University

NANCY L. ROSE, Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Members

JONATHAN M. GRUBER, Massachusetts Institute of Technology

VALERIE A. RAMEY, University of California at San Diego

MONIKA PIAZZESI, Stanford University

MICHAEL WOODFORD, Columbia University

ANIL K KASHYAP, University of Chicago

ROSA L. MATZKIN, University of California at Los Angeles

Ex Officio Members

ORLEY C. ASHENFELTER, Princeton University

ROBERT E. HALL, Stanford University

Appointed Members

Editor, The American Economic Review

PINELOPI KOUJIANOU GOLDBERG, Yale University

Editor, The Journal of Economic Literature

JANET M. CURRIE, Princeton University

Editor, The Journal of Economic Perspectives

DAVID H. AUTOR, Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Editor, American Economic Journal: Applied Economics

ESTHER DUFLO, Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Editor, American Economic Journal: Economic Policy

ALAN J. AUERBACH, University of California at Berkeley

Editor, American Economic Journal: Macroeconomics

JOHN LEAHY, New York University

Editor, American Economic Journal: Microeconomics

ANDREW POSTLEWAITE, University of Pennsylvania

Secretary-Treasurer

JOHN J. SIEGFRIED, Vanderbilt University and University of Adelaide

OTHER OFFICERS

Editor, Resources for Economists

WILLIAM GOFFE, State University of New York at Oswego

Director of AEA Publication Services

JANE EMILY VOROS, Pittsburgh

Managing Director of EconLit Product Design and Content

STEVEN L. HUSTED, University of Pittsburgh

Associate Secretary-Treasurer

PETER L. ROUSSEAU, Vanderbilt University

Counsel

TERRY CALVANI, Freshfields Bruckhaus Deringer LLP Washington, DC

ADMINISTRATORS

Administrative Director

REGINA H. MONTGOMERY

Convention Manager

MARLENE HIGHT



The Journal of
Economic Perspectives

Winter 2012, Volume 26, Number 1

Symposia

Energy Challenges

Hunt Allcott and Michael Greenstone, “Is There an Energy Efficiency Gap?”

Paul L. Joskow, “Creating a Smarter U.S. Electricity Grid”

Lucas W. Davis, “Prospects for Nuclear Power”

Severin Borenstein, “The Private and Public Economics of
Renewable Electricity Generation”

Christopher R. Knittel, “Reducing Petroleum Consumption from Transportation”

Catherine Wolfram, Ori Shelef, and Paul Gertler, “How Will Energy
Demand Develop in the Developing World?”

Higher Education

David J. Deming, Claudia Goldin, and Lawrence F. Katz, “The For-Profit
Postsecondary School Sector: Nimble Critters or Agile Predators?”

Christopher Avery and Sarah Turner, “Student Loans: Do College Students
Borrow Too Much—Or Not Enough?”

Ronald G. Ehrenberg, “American Higher Education in Transition”

Articles

Maury Gittleman and Brooks Pierce, “Compensation for State and Local
Government Workers”

Recommendations for Further Reading • Notes

